

Incoherent Orders and Aphasia State in Chinese Society

Notes on A Sojourn at Five Willows Park, Wenzhou, China

Yan Zhou, April 2018

Contact: [yannias@gmail.com](mailto:yannias@gmail.com)

## Abstract

Based on the reading of Foucault's *The Order of Things* and other material and reflections of my sojourn at the Five Willows Park in Wenzhou, China, I intend to explore two questions in this paper: 1) how do incoherent orders coexist in contemporary Chinese society; and 2) how do some aspects of these orders stay in an aphasia state in contemporary time. I argue that the forms in an aphasia state function as a comfort zone for people in our time.

*keywords:* Foucault, order of things, aphasia, Chinese society

## Incoherent Orders and Aphasia State in Chinese Society

## Notes on A Sojourn at Five Willows Park, Wenzhou, China

Because of some unexpected situations, my one week trip to Beijing during the Fall school term in 2018 was prolonged to an unknown date. Disoriented, I flew to Wenzhou in order to get away from the suffocating and chaotic environment in Beijing; and to regain an orderly sense of time and space so I can concentrate on my study. Wenzhou is situated at the southeastern corner of Zhejiang Province. It is a mountainous area adjacent to the eastern edge of the Pacific Ocean (the East China Sea). It has been a household name since China's Reform and Opening to the World in the 1980s. Wenzhou businessmen and Wenzhou money represent the speculative investment drive of Chinese society; and they often manipulate the market, especially the real estates market. As I imagined before the trip, the city would be crowded with ugly factories and buildings, with the smell of money floating over it. Aside from this common knowledge of the place, I had also heard from some friends that nearby Wenzhou there are lovely mountains and a beautiful river called *Nan Xi Jiang* (Phoebe River). That was enough to entice me.

When I watched the vast span of winding mountains and valleys enveloped by mists and clouds in the plane, the ancient name of Wenzhou: *Yong Jia* did not come to my mind. All I was conscious was its contemporaneity. Not only its ancient name was disconnected with the place, but also all the history and culture relate to the old name were dormant in my mind; even though I was not ignorant of the ancient literati tradition of the place. This phenomenon happened several times during my sojourn in Wenzhou. The culture and history of a place would elope with its name of a particular time from the consciousness is puzzling for me.

After the landing when I took a taxi to Wenzhou University where I would stay, I noticed Wenzhou is a middle-sized modern city. It was well planned, and not as ugly and crowded with high-rise buildings as I had imagined. The taxi-driver was listening to some Cantonese rock songs in high volume. The agitated sound whirled with the warm breeze and the reddish glow of the setting sun, it made one feel the South instantly. At a red-light stop, a tint of late fall sweet osmanthus fragrance swam in the car, so pleasant. My old friend professor Jin was away to attend a conference in another city, he arranged for me a hotel room in the University located at the skirt of the city. In China, most universities had been removed or newly built away from the center of a city. It is one facet of Chinese urbanization and modernization in recent decades — strictly planned, highly organized, and enforced according to scientific design and efficient governing needs. The hotel is on the fifth floor of a giant, rectangular building. It looks like a big shopping center, with supermarkets, shops, restaurants, a cinema, a karaoke club, hotels and else. The deployment is a model of Chinese modern life complex.

I did not sleep well that night. The noise from the cinema and the karaoke club in the building lasted until 2 am. At five o'clock in the morning, a group of middle-aged and senior people started to do “square dance” in the nearby square. Square Dance is a mixture of the Red-Guard dance, folk dance and Rock 'n' Roll Dance which is very popular among many aged and few young people. They often practice it in public spaces with loud noises. Several generations of people who grew up during the Cultural Revolution had been deprived of the opportunity of education and had little choices of entertainment. They had been shaped by state ideology and propaganda to such a degree that the forms of entertainment, language, physical and emotional expressions were mold by the state. They take for granted to neglect and violate the peace of the

neighborhood when they do the dance. This form of entertainment is unbearable to some people not only because it is disturbing but also because it makes people feel the communism spirit is still alive. However, it is a form which is part of these generations' collective experience and memories. Historicity is also contemporary as long as people who carry particular historical life modes with them are alive.

I searched wechat (the most popular Chinese social media platform) and found a hostel in Five Willows Park on Tea Mountain, which is only fifteen minutes drive from the university. So I moved there. The park was built at the foot of west end of Tea Mountain. The entrance hall was a huge slope-roofed open space, lined up with cabinets of half-gems and rock samples on plinths. Passed the entrance hall there was a meadow. It looked like a late nineteenth-century natural history display hall. In the middle of the meadow stood a huge life-size chimpanzee sculpture, somebody stuck a rose on one of its ears. Further inside, the garden looked different — folded and unfolded, a classical Chinese garden extended from the meadow up to the mountain. There was a pool, a waterfall, long corridors with wall-paintings of The Twenty-Four Filial Exemplars stories<sup>1</sup>, a gallery for classical art exhibition and gathering, a tea house, several pavilions by the water or on the mountain, and else. The hostel was a five-story classical building built on the mountain. Bamboos brushed hotel rooms windows, and the waterfall was only a few meters away. It felt like a place for a reclusive.

The park was quiet in the night. Dogs barked for a while then only waterfall swashed the night air and the sleep. I woke up by the birds songs. When daylight regained the world, I heard people on a nearby mountain-ridge sang a kind of folk songs with a loudspeaker. The language

---

<sup>1</sup> <http://pages.ucsd.edu/~dkjordan/chin/shiaw/FilialExemplarsEnglish.pdf>

was unrecognizable. Later my friend told me it is a type of local dramas sang in the local dialect, very old ones. It was a daily routine, villagers sang and listened to it between the breakfast and morning labor in the field or other business.

After ten o'clock, the garden started to fill with noises. Groups of ladies dressed in classical Chinese costumes would pose on the bridge, by the pool or the waterfall, or clung to trees; and a photographer would take photos of them. The costumes were red and green — the symbolic colors of the socialism aesthetic taste; and they were cheaply made. It is similar to the cosplay seen in pioneer villages in North American. Just like the weird chimpanzee sculpture, they are signs of the spectacular cultural forms (Debord, 2017) appeared in the process of modernization and globalization since the 1980s. It also has the distinctive characteristics of the socialism cultural imaginations, belonging to a seemingly past era. Is it really the vestige of a bygone time? I wonder. Its presence is strange, displaced from both the time and space. It is a form that some people adhere to but there is no content within. This form without content is a deserted house that functions as a reservoir of unconscious collective memories, in which people can find some comfort. It is a comfort zone suspended between language (representation) and life (empirical knowledge).

Outside of the park, passing a little stone bridge, a village spreads along a little river and up the mountain. Women washed clothes in the river. There were three old banyan trees by the riverside, they from five hundred to eight hundred years old. There was also an old *mei ren kao* on the riverbank — a local style wooden gallery with benches and rails for people to rest. In the streets, I met children went to or came back from schools on uniforms. One did not know if someone lives in one of the small houses in the village has a global business network. There was

one small restaurant selling rice-noodles and wonton soup; and two families used their parlor rooms as convenient stores. One day a girl I met in a shop complained to me: “Whenever anyone talks about Wenzhou people, they thought that Wenzhou people are rich and arrogant. They are wrong. In all the world and in anywhere, there is only a small percentage of rich people. Most people just live an ordinary life and many are still poor.” Her words made me think how often the common knowledge is actually false, or at least partial.

I read and studied in my hotel room most time, and would have a meal in the village and go for a walk along the river or up the mountain once or twice every day. During the walk, I often met some Taoism and Buddhism monks. Later I discovered more than half a dozen temples of Taoism, Buddhism, and also some unknown local religions scattered in the mountain. My friend told me there are hundreds of temples in Wenzhou and dozens of churches. Actually, there has been a large population of Christians in Wenzhou since the fourteenth century.

Christianization began with the presence of Portuguese and later Dutch explorers and missionaries at the time. The temples were full of images, signs, symbols, aphorism, and stories. I had very limited knowledge of these things. One day I noticed a *fu wen* (Taoist magic scripts) on a lintel of a house, it was beautifully written. When I asked villagers around what does it say, nobody could answer me. They just told me the sign would drive away evil spirits and bring good lucks. It is a form that contains obscure content. The content is mystical and magic that could only be known by monks or some scholars. But it is also part of local people’s life.

When I started to write this essay, I suddenly recognized the name of the park where I stayed came from the byname of Tao Yuanming (365?–427), who was the greatest Chinese poet and the forefather of Chinese hermetic poets. In his autobiography “Biography of Master of Five

Willows” he wrote: “We do not know where this master is from, nor do we have details of his family name or byname. Besides his house stand five willow trees, and thus he was so called (385).” Why the association of the name and the poet did not come to my mind when I was staying there? This puzzled me. It seemed that my consciousness was caged within a contemporary framework, so a name that has a specific traditional connotation would not come to life even though it should be so obvious.

A few days after I arrived in Wenzhou, my friend came back and he took me to see some old places in the region. When we drove through mountains, I saw the real scenes of Chinese classical landscape paintings where tulle-like mists drifting in the verdant valleys. I recalled Wenzhou’s name *Yong Jia* in ancient times. That old name reminded me that Wenzhou was actually the birthplace of Chinese landscape culture (manifested in poetry and paintings). These mountains once were written by Xie Lingyun (385–433), the earliest landscape poet. In one of his most famous poems "Stone Gate Mountain's Highest Peak", he described his meditations on



nature and the relationship between his inner pattern and the flux of things<sup>2</sup>. The old name was vivified when I was truly in the represented scenes, and when language and things are together. When they are separate, the name would not come out naturally.

In the trip, my friend took me to the coast of the East China Sea. We passed some ancient fortresses which were built to defend Japanese pirates from the fourteenth to the sixteenth century. Anyone who has some primary education knows the heroes who fought with Japanese pirates and how this history related to the close-up of sea borders in Ming Dynasty (1368–1644). But my friend told me that the history we have been taught was a fiction. There were not so many Japanese pirates at the time, actually, most pirates were people from Wenzhou or nearby

---

<sup>2</sup> "Stone Gate Mountain's Highest Peak" by Xie Lingyun

At dawn, staff in hand, I climb the crags,  
 and by dusk settle among the mountains.  
 Scarcely a peak rises as high as this hut  
 facing crags and overlooking winding streams.  
 Forests stretch before the mountain's open gate  
 boulders heaped round its very steps.  
 Mountains crowd around, blocking out roads.  
 Trails wander into bamboo thickets.  
 Visitors lose their way on coming up  
 or forget the paths leading home when they descend.  
 Raging torrents rush through the dusk,  
 Monkeys howl throughout the night.  
 Deep in meditation I hold the inner pattern,  
 nurturing the Way, never severing from it.  
 My heart is one with the autumn trees,  
 My eyes delight in the flowering of spring.  
 I inhabit the constant and await my end,  
 Content to dwell in peace, accepting the flux of things.  
 I only regret that there is no kindred spirit here  
 to climb this ladder of sky and clouds with me

areas. They were participants of the Age of Discovery. What do we know? We could learn what does a history tell, and even how does it tell; but how could we know the history that was not written, and not told by authorities?

Another day I visited Wenzhou Museum which is the largest museum in the region. It was established in 1958. The major permanent exhibitions include historical exhibition, crafts art exhibition, and natural history exhibition. The model is a combination of the early Western modernism museums, the socialism museum, and the local components. This museum (and almost all the same type museums in China) structures its master narratives based on progressive historical views and scientific evolutionary theories. The Western progressive historical view has been integrated into the construction of Chinese nationalism master narrative, that is the “Five Thousand Years of Chinese Civilization” myth as described by Lu Di Yin (2012). In Wenzhou museum, the storyline of the permanent historical exhibition is “Five Thousand Years History of Wenzhou People”. When Agnes Heller (2011) analyzed the Western modernity she coined the term “master narrative” as “an *arche* of a culture, which are stories to which people always return; and are the final or ultimate foundations of cultural imaginations (p. 129).” Unlike the Western master narratives that are based on the Christian belief and Greek-Roman historiography and philosophy which emphasize the individual’s ethical and intellectual free choice (129); the modern Chinese master narrative of the Chinese civilization is created to cultivate the patriotism in people’s mind. Its mechanism is propaganda education and is exerted on people. People lost their subjectivity when this master narrative is infused into their consciousness and become part of their unconscious worldview. A master narrative has to be believed and people have an emotional and ethical connection with it. As a compound of cultural essentialism and hegemonic

brainwashing mechanism, the master narrative used in Wenzhou Museum is not like beliefs and imaginations of Confucianism, Taoism, and Buddhism which composed the foundations of more substantial Chinese master narratives; it is more like a pseudo-master-narrative which shaped people's mind and alienated people from their lives in contemporary time.

The similar problem exists in the natural history exhibition in the museum, where the master narrative is based on scientific-evolutional theories. The earliest natural history museums in China were built by the Western naturalists and missionaries which were part of the global supply network of the Western world's natural objects collections (Xu Jian, 2016, p. 35-52). The kind of narrative has constituted the dominating public scientific knowledge for over a century, although it might have been challenged in scientific and intellectual worlds. The problem with it is that the classification system and interpretation schema embedded in this narrative do not correspond to the previous Chinese classifications and interpretations of nature which were deeply rooted in local culture and life. The current dominant scientific-evolutional narrative is the accepted knowledge which has made the specific local knowledge closely entwined with life marginalized. To complement this stiff and alienating knowledge system, Wenzhou Museum includes local marine lives samples. Although the display and the interpretation are still the stereotypes of the Western natural history museum, these local objects nonetheless create an emotional connection with local people, so the knowledge and life are connected.

### **Reflections**

All these fragments of observations in Wenzhou are sources of my inquiries regarding knowledge, representation, and life. They are like Borge's Chinese encyclopedia as described in Foucault's *The Order of Things* which has no common locus and no coherence (2002). On one

hand there is the highly techno-state organized, socialism and neoliberalism characterized, modernized, and globalized contemporary social and life forms; on the other hand, there are layers deposits of various traditional and local social, cultural and life forms. Modern Western concepts and representations coexist with the socialism narratives and expressions, and other more ancient, substantial but obscure representation forms. The relationship between names, signs, language, and things are displaced or broken up.

### **Incoherent Orders**

In Western culture, since the Renaissance Age, people tried to explain how they think about the world, the process is a continual constructing and deconstructing of the orders of thought that regulates the relationship between words and things. From encyclopedias and dictionaries to the structuralism and post-structuralism, and now the Google Era, people have struggled between ordering the infinity of the world according to certain epistemological systems, and liberating the thought from the infinity and impossibility of knowledge to infinity interpretations of a limited moments in the fluxes of the reality (Groiš, 2016, p. 149-156; Law, 2004; Foucault, 2002). The “Imaginary Prisons” by Giovanni Battista Piranesi (2013), Borges’s Library of Babel or the Garden of Forking Paths (2007), and Italo Calvino’s Mr. Palomar who read a wave (2007) are all analogies of this struggle. In the Google Era where we are now, words attain to a democratic state, breaking the hierarchy of grammarian chains as described by Boris Groiš, who termed it as “word clouds” where all words have extra-grammatical freedom and equality, and they can migrate freely. Discourses are only conditioned by the existing knowledge database.

The pre-Google era modernism orders, the Google Era globalized world order, together with the Chinese local and traditional orders, formed the triple-fold systems in contemporary China. These orders interact and contagion each other, but they do not share a common locus, they are juxtaposed. Foucault lived in the pre-internet world. But he had already perceived that our epoch is the epoch of space, and its essence is configuration.(1986, p. 22). However, the configuration is hierarchically deployed.

In the information world, people live in a virtual reality which duplicates, overlaps and re-interprets the offline world. People have certain subjectivity although this subjectivity is also constrained by various political, social, cultural and technological orders. While within the order of the state socialism-capitalism system, one's subjectivity is relatively deprived. Narratives are enforced on and unconsciously built-in people's mind. People do not believe in what is said, but their consciousness and expressions of emotions and senses are shaped and dominated by the propaganda. The vast blankness of content and the absence of subjectivity make the form the only content. This is what lies behind the phenomena such as the Square Dance and the exotic costume-dressing ladies pose for pictures. Propaganda is the most powerful strategy of controlling of people created by the dictatorship mechanism which is an extreme state of the modernism. It created several generations of people who have lived with forms without content. The state is still trying to strengthen this mechanism to create future generations who will continually be deprived of their subjectivity. The traditional culture although is more deeply rooted in and more intimate to people's life, nevertheless, it has been marginalized or manipulated by both the modernism and the state power. It is the realm that has been driven to the half-aphasia state.

There also exists a generation gap. People who were born in the countryside and grew up before the Cultural Revolution era tend to cling to traditional forms of life. People who grew up and were educated during the Cultural Revolution era have been accustomed to life forms without content; and as they are in their primal age holding powers in the country, they are trying to duplicate the world they were framed to control the contemporary world. This explains the current return of the conservatism in China. The younger generations migrate away from both the traditional and the state-socialism orders, they delve into the information age where they create their own subjectivity. Although this virtual world is based on algorithm and grammar, words and numbers, interpretations of interpretations, and representations of representations; nonetheless, the content and the form do not invalidate each other.

This contemporary configuration is unlike the co-existence of multiple epistemological fields (*episteme*) (Foucault, 2002; Potts, 2011)<sup>3</sup> in ancient China, which is essentially a complementary deployment of different *episteme*. By looking at the concepts of naming in different Chinese classical schools, one can see how different *episteme* occupied different sites and complemented each other in private and social lives.

Confucius (551 BC -479 BC) thought that one obtains knowledge through investigating things. The knowledge thus gained will be the foundation to cultivate and regulate one's thoughts, heart, oneself as an ethical person, and then his family, state, and ultimately enable people to build a kingdom regulated by virtue (The Great Learning). It is comparable to the concentric order of the Middle Age in Europe. Italian poet Eugenio Montale said that Dante is

---

<sup>3</sup> In addition to Foucault's definition of *episteme* in his preface (p. xxiii) to *The Order of Things*; David L. Potts gave an insightful analysis of the word in his essay "Knowledge and Power in Foucault" (2011).

the last concentric poet who brought the Middle Age to a close, when the coming of the encyclopedism can no longer create a universe but only an immense amassing of notions of a provisional character, in a perpetual expansion (151-153). Comparable to the pre-encyclopedism age in Europe, Confucianism holds the individual and the society together through an episteme that is based on empirical knowledge and transforms the knowledge with ethical and poetic connotations.

While this *episteme* had organized Chinese culture and society efficiently over two thousand years, people were not satisfied with being dominated by this ethical-social organization, they wanted to find the freedom of life when Confucianism failed to provide it. Zhuang Zi offered an alternative choice. The freedom is to understand the relationship between constraints and the infinity, and the nameable and the unnameable; thus he could find the freedom that is not suppressed by the hierarchy and prejudice of words. The paragraph quoted below illustrate beautifully what Zhuang Zi perceived as the freedom.

... To have a name and a real existence — that is the condition of a thing. Not to have a name, and not to have real being — that is vacancy and no thing. We may speak and we may think about it, but the more we speak, the wider shall we be of the mark. Birth, before it comes, cannot be prevented; death, when it has happened, cannot be traced farther. Death and life are not far apart; but why they have taken place cannot be seen. That someone has caused them, or that there has been no action in the case are but speculations of doubt. When I look for their origin, it goes back into infinity; when I look for their end, it proceeds without termination. Infinite, unceasing, there is no room for words about (the Dao). To regard it as in the category of things is the origin of the

language that it is caused or that it is the result of doing nothing; but it would end as it began with things. The Dao cannot have a (real) existence; if it has, it cannot be made to appear as if it had not. The name Dao is a metaphor, used for the purpose of description. To say that it causes or does nothing is but to speak of one phase of things, and has nothing to do with the Great Subject. If words were sufficient for the purpose, in a day's time we might exhaust it; since they are not sufficient, we may speak all day, and only exhaust (the subject of) things. The Dao is the extreme to which things conduct us.

Neither speech nor silence is sufficient to convey the notion of it. Neither by speech nor by silence can our thoughts about it have their highest expression (Ze-Yang).

Laozi, on the other hand, contemplated the relationship between the world that exists outside of human knowledge and the world that is conceived by human knowledge. He said: "The name that can be named is not the enduring and unchanging name. (Conceived of as) having no name, it is the Originator of heaven and earth; (conceived of as) having a name, it is the Mother of all things (Tao Te Ching)".

From a very different and purely metaphysical approach, Gongsunlongzi also probed naming and things. In his metaphysical article "On Naming" he argued:

- The thing is nothing else but what is named; but the naming is not what is named.
- If there is no naming in the world, the thing will not be the thing. What is not named is the world, but is the thing the naming?

There is also one aspect needs to mention. In Chinese culture, people consciously left a realm untouched by language reserved it to rituals and other more primeval forms of representations. In *The Analects* there is an entry: "The subjects on which the Master did not talk,



were: extraordinary things, feats of strength, disorder, and spiritual beings.” By not talking about the eccentrics; and not naming, defining, and describing these things, Confucius left a world be with itself and not to alter it and control it, thus allowing the relationship between people and the infinity of the world open.

There were dozens of other schools and clans of religious or metaphysical thoughts established in China. Some were more significant and determinant; some were more hidden and obscure. They all merged with and distinguished from each other over the time, and constructed a complementary world order in ancient China and enabled it with great adaptability and flexibility until the modernism dissected this world and its orders.

### **Aphasia as the Comfort Zone**

In another section of Zhuangzi, he discussed the ideal world order of no-name. He used the analogy of the talk of villages.

Hamlets and Villages are formed by the union — say of ten surnames and a hundred names, and are considered to be (the source of) manners and customs. The differences between them are united to form their common character, and what is common to them is separately apportioned to form the differences... So it is that the mounds and hills are made to be the elevations that they are by accumulations of earth which individually are but low. (So also rivers like) the *Jiang* and the *He* obtain their greatness by the union of (other smaller) waters with them. And (in the same way) the Great man exhibits the common sentiment of humanity by the union in himself of all its individualities. Hence when ideas come to him from without, though he has his own decided view, he does not hold it with bigotry; and when he gives out his own decisions, which are correct, the

views of others do not oppose them... All things have their different constitutions and modes of actions, but the Dao (which directs them) is free from all partiality, and therefore it has no name. Having no name, it therefore does nothing. Doing nothing, there is nothing which it does not do. Each season has its ending and beginning; each age has its changes and transformations; misery and happiness regularly alternate. Here our views are thwarted, and yet the result may afterwards have our approval; there we insist on our own views, and looking at things differently from others, try to correct them, while we are in error ourselves. The case may be compared to that of a great marsh, in which all its various vegetation finds a place, or we may look at it as a great hill, where trees and rocks are found on the same terrace. Such may be a description of what is intended by "The Talk of the Hamlets and Villages. (Ze-Yang)"

In this ideal world, The differences form a union by their commonness, but each will not superimpose on the other and keep their distinctiveness. The Great Man would open to the difference and not employ his prejudice. It is an attitude that is open, friendly, free, and relaxing. This ancient prototype of thinking finds its contemporary echo in Giorgio Agamben, who thought that the current struggle of the human being is that between whatever state-techno mechanism and the nonstate (humanity). All people on the earth now are trying to recover the position of a remnant (Agamben, 2016; and "Marginal Notes on Comments on Society of the Spectacle"). This state of nonstate and the position of a remnant could only be found in what I have observed as forms without content and language that is displaced (temporarily) from things (its contexts). It is the state of aphasia from which people try to find the voice and the word.

In an interview with ArtWorld, Beijing based artist Liang Yuanwei talked about how she has been inspired by the art of Dunhuang Caves. She said:

When we went to school as children, we could not understand our own civilization, and indeed there were no ways to understand it. Our ways of thinking and solving problems were all from the West. When we grew up we went back and tried to understand. It took a long time, because these past treasures are not connected to one's daily life, and the education was totally absent. The family could not provide any support too, because the connection with the past had been broken up since our parents' generation. Even the architectures that we live in have no more than ten years' history. There are no traces of the past in life, we are living completely in a floating state. In the northwestern region, the mountains where the temple was built were still there, so do the topology and the landscape, and four seasons still shift. In Roma, if you walk out you will see things that have existed more than two hundred years. Upstairs people use things that were made in the seventeenth century, so did the floor and the door. The public spaces where you move around have at least two hundred years history. So there does not have a sense of the rupture, and there are many museums. All these things enable people to live in a continual, unbroken and complete line (2018).

Her reflections genuinely represent what I described as aphasia in Chinese society that appeared as early as the Cultural Revolution time, and has become worsened since the neoliberalism, state-capitalism, and globalization have become the hegemonic power. All over the world, only scientific systems connect and control people. This is how Wenzhou University was planned and built; why more than 1.5 million migrant workers were evicted from Beijing in

last winter to make space for an ideal, beautiful, and high-end capital blueprint; and how the lovely village where I sojourned in Wenzhou will be demolished for a new highway, in order to bring people to enjoy the beauty of the mountains! Human beings have become dots to be put somewhere on a grid, completely utilized. Knowledge does not relate to life and happiness. If one wants a knowledge to become relevant to one's life, one has to regain subjectivity of the knowledge; and not let the knowledge forced upon oneself. It has to become one's own knowledge, experience, happiness, wisdom, and freedom.

Foucault revealed unspoken orders of a middle region which is fundamental to a culture. He believed things in this region (*aphasiacs*) still have their orders and regularities which can be discovered. In local rituals, customs and forms of life where language is dormant or hidden, signs and forms function as comforting elements. When a name meets its place and all the content it contains revived, just like when I recalled Tao Yuanming and Xie Lingyun, the aphasia finds its voice. Friedrich Hölderlin's words is a testimony to this *recherche* of the truth and comfort in aphasia: "There's a precious sense of well-being in us when our inner life thus draws strength from what is its material, differentiates itself, and establishes truer inner relationships, and our mind gradually comes of age to bear arms. (1990)"

Although Foucault denied his study was conducted as a historian of science; undoubtedly, the book has a historical perception. And each historical period he examined has some distinctive characters that make it different from other periods. Foucault's view amplifies certain aspects and characters of a time but also covers or eclipse some. Alexandre Lianeri argued that the Western historical thought should be located in a global and pluralized network of concepts, and criticized Foucault's emphasis on models failed in changing the existing hierarchy order (2011,

p.24). In other words, the Western historical thought was more diversified and richer than Foucault revealed in any historical period. There are also some other critical analysis or views of Foucault's thought. For example, David Macey thought that archaeology ignores individuals and their histories (1993, p. 163); Gayatri Chakravorty Spivak used her concept of subaltern to criticize the "epistemic violence" (2012); and Grois found that the infinity possibility of interpretations of words make the question of meaning becomes impossible (2016, p.150). To conclude my sojourn on the topic: in order to reveal the dormant and silent things from their historical and local caves, we will need to go further from Foucault and other post-structuralists. Because these things are important for those who find comfort in aphasia which is deeply entangled with a society's inherent life.

## References

- Agamben, G. (n.d.). *Marginal Notes on Comments on Society of the Spectacle: Giorgio Agamben*. Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://libcom.org/library/marginal-notes-comments-society-spectacle-giorgio-agamben>
- Agamben, G. (2016). *The use of bodies* (A. Kotsko, Trans.). Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.
- Borges, J. L., & Yates, D. A. (2007). *Labyrinths: Selected stories & other writings* (J. E. Irby & W. Gibson, Trans.). NY, NY: New Directions.
- Calvino, I. (2007). *Mr. Palomar* (W. Weaver, Trans.). Toronto: L & OD.
- Confucius. (n.d.). Confucianism - Chinese Text Project Dictionary/Confucianism/The great learning (D. Sturgeon, Ed.; J. Legge, Trans.). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://ctext.org/liji/da-xue>
- Confucius. (n.d.). Chinese Text Project Dictionary/Confucianism/The Analects/Shu Er (D. Sturgeon, Ed.; J. Legge, Trans.). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://ctext.org/dictionary.pl?if=en&id=1271#s10020822>
- Debord, G. (2012). *The society of the spectacle* (D. Nicholson-Smith, Trans.). New York: Zone Books.
- Gongsunlongzi. (n.d.). Chinese Text Project Dictionary/Gongsunlongzi/On Naming (D. Sturgeon, Ed.; Y. Zhou, Trans.). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://ctext.org/gongsunlongzi/zhi-wu-lun>
- Groß, B. (2016). *In the flow*. London: Verso.
- Hölderlin, F., & Santner, E. L. (1990). *Hyperion and selected poems*. New York, NY: Continuum.

- Law, John. 2004. *After Method: Mess in Social Science Research*. London: Routledge
- Lianeri, A. (2011). Unfounding times: The idea and ideal of ancient history in Western historical thought. In A. Lianeri (Ed.), *The Western Time of Ancient History: Historiographical Encounters with the Greek and Roman Pasts* (pp. 3–30). introduction, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. <http://doi.org.myaccess.library.utoronto.ca/10.1017/CBO9780511975998.001>
- Lu, Di Yin. 2012. “Seizing Civilization: Antiquities in Shanghai's Custody, 1949–1996”. PhD. diss., Order No. 3514423, Harvard University. In PROQUESTMS ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.
- Foucault, M. (2002). *The order of things: An archaeology of the human sciences*. London: Routledge.
- Foucault, M. (1986). Of Other Spaces (J. Miskowiec, Trans.). *Diacritics*, 16(1), 22. doi: 10.2307/464648
- Foucault, M. (2006). *Aesthetics, method, and epistemology* (J. D. Faubion, Ed.; R. Hurley, Trans.). New York: New Press.
- Heller, Ágnes. 2011. *Aesthetics and Modernity: Essays*. Lanham: Lexington Books.
- Liang, Y., & ArtWorld. (n.d.). Dunhung is the Matrix. Retrieved April 17, 2018, from <https://mp.weixin.qq.com/s/NEeVubJJo6KKe-gZGPwpUw>
- Laozi, & Legge, J. (n.d.). Chinese Text Project Dictionary/Dao De Jing (D. Sturgeon, Ed.). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://ctext.org/dao-de-jing>
- Law, John. 2004. *After Method: Mess in Social Science Research*. London: Routledge.
- Macey, D. (1993). *The lives of Michel Foucault*. London: Hutchinson.

- Montale, E. (1982). Dante, Yesterday and Today (1965). In *The second life of art: Selected essays of Eugenio Montale* (J. Galassi, Trans.). New York: Ecco Pr.
- Piranesi's "Imaginary Prisons". (2013, December 14). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <http://www.italianways.com/piranesi-imaginary-prisons>
- Potts, D. L. (2011, February 27). Knowledge and Power in Foucault. Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://atlassociety.org/objectivism/atlas-university/deeper-dive-blog/4405-knowledge-and-power-in-foucault-s-history-of-sexuality>
- Swartz, W., Campany, R. F., Lu, Y., & Choo, J. J. (2014). *Early medieval China: A sourcebook*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Spivak, G. C. (2010). *Can the subaltern speak?: Reflections on the history of an idea* (R. C. Morris, Ed.). New York: Columbia University Press.
- Swartz, W., Campany, R. F., Lu, Y., & Choo, J. J. (Eds.). (2014). *Early medieval China: A sourcebook*. New York: Columbia University Press.
- Wellmon, C. (2010). Goethe's Morphology of Knowledge, or the Overgrowth of Nomenclature. *Goethe Yearbook* 17(1), 153-177. North American Goethe Society. Retrieved November 23, 2017, from Project MUSE database.
- Xie, L., & Hinton, D. (2001). The mountain poems of Hsieh Ling-yün ; translated by David Hinton. New York: New Directions.
- Xu, Jian. 2016. *Great Foundations: an Intellectual History of Early Chinese Museums*. Beijing: Science Press.



Zhuangzi. (n.d.). Chinese Text Project Dictionary/Zhuangzi/Miscellaneous Chapters/Ze-yang(D. Sturgeon, Ed.; J. Legge, Trans.). Retrieved April 16, 2018, from <https://ctext.org/zhuangzi/ze-yang>